

對特定性別以亦師亦友方式輔導其機制之權能與盲點 (The power and pitfalls of gender-specific mentorship)

●MAJ. KRISTYN FELIX、MAJ. EBONY THOMAS



作者：克里斯汀·費利克斯 少校、艾波尼·湯馬斯 少校

譯者：黃于玲 上士

士官高級班 35 期；曾任無線電話士、組長、
台長現任陸軍步兵訓練指揮部特業組通化小組教官。

取材/2021 年 4 月美國陸軍月刊(ARMY, January/20120)

Tuesday, June 23, 2020

Mentorship is a critical investment tool that should be used to cultivate the strength and diversity of the Army. To sustain the talent of a workforce, organizations invest in their people through formal and informal mentorship. The Army thrives because of its diversity of talent, and mentorship is critical to ensure diverse leaders within the ranks.

2020 年 6 月 23 日，星期二

師友關係式輔導機制是為因應陸軍培養軍事實力與多元化關鍵性的投資工具。各層級組織透過正式與非正式師友關係式之機制以輔導其所屬人員，以確保其工作能順暢推動與運作。陸軍的成長茁壯，依靠擁有多元化才能之官兵，而師友關係式輔導機制，對確保各層級具備多元化的領導者是至關重要的。

The Army defines mentorship as “a voluntary and developmental relationship that exists between a person with greater experience and a person with less experience, characterized by mutual trust and respect.” Successful and experienced military leaders take time to personally develop subordinate leaders to ensure the next generation of leaders is ready.

美陸軍準則對師友關係式輔導定義為：「在極具豐富經驗與經驗匱乏者之間，輔導與被輔導者基於信賴與尊重，自願性培養與發展相互間之關係。」一個成功且經驗豐富的軍事領導者，會親自運用時間培養下級領導者獲得專業與人格成長以確保下一代領導者做好領導作為相關準備。

Mentorship is not based on gender, but on experience and skills. This implies that mentorship is a tool that should be used for development that promotes continuity of an institution and values that transcend differences of gender, race and national origin.

Is there a need to have formalized female group mentorship programs in this era of the Army? In this article, we will discuss the pros and cons of gender-specific mentorship. The viewpoints are organized around three topics: gender-specific topics, inclusion and trust.

師友關係式輔導是以經驗與專業技能為基礎，而非性別。這意味著師友關係式輔導機制是一種工具，是用於彰顯應持續推動超越性別、種族與國籍差異者的一種制度與價值觀。

對於身處於女性官兵已可派任戰鬥兵科及任務的年代，陸軍是否必須有一特定形式的女性師友關係式輔導團體規劃？本文旨在探討特定性別師友關係式輔導機制的優缺點，並環繞在理解特定性別需要輔導的議題、包容因性別差異困境處理方式與建立值得信賴的特定性別師友輔導機制等三個主題。

Gender-Specific Topics

理解特定性別需要輔導的議題

Women-specific issues are not the only basis for mentorship groups, but they can often take the forefront because it is much easier to address women's issues with other women. There are issues men will never go through, such as menstruation, pregnancy, postpartum depression, hair regulations and others. New mothers have professional and personal hardships that are not easily understood by men. Intangibles such as postpartum depression or the changes the female body goes through after pregnancy might not be easy to talk about with men. Almost instinctively, women are able to help other women.

由於女性對女性較易抒發相關女性難言之隱的觀點，藉由女性這個特定性別問題著手入門師友關係式輔導機制，可更加容易理解如何看待其他需要師友關係式輔導機制的團體。有些女性問題男性從未經歷過，如經期、懷孕、產後抑鬱、女性長髮整理相關規定和其他女性特有問題。新手媽媽所面臨育兒專業問題與個人艱辛程度是男性難以想像與理解的。又如產後抑鬱的症狀或因懷孕身體狀況變化而難以捉摸，面對男性更是難以啟齒，而大多數女性基於同理心亦會對其他女性伸出援手。

While gender-specific groups provide a safe space to discuss personal issues, they also promote segregation in the Army and allow soldiers to remain ignorant of others' issues. Soldiers react to uncomfortable situations differently, and their reactions may cause a rift between them. Male and female soldiers should learn how to communicate with each other regardless of the topic. This is a must on the battlefield, in training and in everyday garrison operations.

提供多元化下特定性別族群一個安全空間以討論隱密問題，會助長部隊中對不同性別的隔閡，甚至默許不同性別官兵對其他特定性別有關問題的潛存。儘管部隊官兵對不同性別之差異性，會因引發問題的情況而產生彆扭不安，其反應會因人而異，但這些反應卻可能引起不同性別對解決問題心態發生分歧。在面對其他人視而不見的諸多問題上，男女官兵應摒除性別差異所產生的成見，學習如何相互溝通，因為不管是在戰場、訓練場或駐地執行日常任務，順暢的溝通仍是必要條件。

If male and female soldiers do not build trust from the beginning, it can be disastrous in combat. Discussing topics that might be uncomfortable for the opposite sex can also be a great learning tool. The discussions will inform decisions in their present and future positions and build candor and empathy in senior leaders.

如果男女性官兵未能在初始即建立相互信賴感，將導致戰鬥時慘痛後果。異性間討論性別相關話題或許會令人不自在，但卻是一個重大工具，有助於他們在目前與未來的職務上，做出適當的決定，並建立他日當上領導者後，能以坦誠態度與同理心來面對。

Inclusion(包容)

包容因性別差異困境處理方式

Women face unique challenges in the military and often have no one to discuss them with. Gender-specific mentorship groups provide an outlet for women who need assistance or guidance who don't feel comfortable addressing their issues with men. Professionally, women in the Army are at a disadvantage because there are fewer women than men in almost every duty station and unit. Discussing hardships with someone who does not understand what you are going through can

be tough. A woman might bring up what she perceives to be a sensitive issue and a man might brush it off as a minuscule issue. While neither side is at fault, there is a difference of opinion.

婦女在軍中面對許多獨特的挑戰，經常得獨自面對而無處發抒與諮商。師友關係式輔導機制可以給那些需要協助或者面臨必須由男性指導如何處理有關女性相關議題會感到不舒服自在的人，提供一個表達出口與商議管道。由於陸軍幾乎所有執勤的地點與單位，都是女性少於男性，因此在專業軍事領域上婦女會處於劣勢地位。在和不理解她們曾經經歷過哪些事項的人一起討論面臨的困境，是很艱難的。女性或許會提出她認為察覺到有關軍事專業上的敏感問題，但男性可能會認為是件微不足道的小事，而嗤之以鼻。由於兩性之間存在不同觀點，因此，也不易論定是非與對錯。

This difference could lead to more hardships for a woman. An example that many women have encountered is going back to work after having a child. There are many intangible issues that arise when a mother is separated from her child that men do not necessarily relate to. While this is a huge issue for women, men could easily brush it off because they might not understand. If the same issue was brought up in a gender-specific mentorship group, it could be discussed openly, and positive solutions could come out of the meeting.

如此的差異可能會讓女性更加辛苦。舉例來說，許多婦女都遇過產後重返職場的困擾，即母親與她的小孩分離，這衍生出許多男性未必能體會的問題。對女性來說上述是一個重大難題，但男性可能不當一回事，因為他們無法理解。若同樣的議題，在師友關係式輔導機制團體中提出，則可以公開討論，並可從中得到正面的解決方案。

For some, there is a negative connotation surrounding the report of a Sexual Harassment/Assault Response and Prevention (SHARP) incident. By reporting, younger women might think they will be labeled in a negative way. Some of the biggest hurdles women face in the Army are SHARP- and equal opportunity-related. Women relate to women on these subjects because they have a basic understanding of how a situation is created and all the issues that surround it. Often, senior female leaders are able to use their experience and knowledge to influence how

younger women think about how women are perceived. When it comes to sexual assault and harassment, women are capable of arming other women with tools to combat this type of behavior.

有時候，舉報遭性騷擾或暴力(侵害)事件(SHARP)，會引來異樣眼光。一旦事態走漏，年輕的女性可能認為自己會被貼上負面標籤。婦女在軍中面臨的最大難題中，即是性騷擾/性暴力(侵害)與兩性平權等相關問題，婦女對這些議題能夠感同身受，因為她們瞭解問題原因及其後果。通常資深女性領導者能透過經驗與知識，開導年輕女性官兵如何正確看待相關事件，因此當遭遇性暴力(侵害)與性騷擾事件時，她們才能鼓足勇氣，起身對抗此類行為。

On the other hand, promoting gender-based mentorship groups implies women in the Army are not seen as equals or integrated. It is important to continue to push the limits of integration so women do not retreat into separation and segregation.

但從另一方面來說，提倡特定性別師友關係式輔導機制，意味著在陸軍中的婦女未受公平及對等的待遇。為了不使婦女們因男女無法平權而產生隔閡，持續推動突破婦女融合的藩籬，事關重大。

In 2015, a case study on gender integration by the U.S. Army Training and Doctrine Command Analysis Center concluded that women should be integrated into combat arms jobs and units. By 2016, women were integrated into combat arms jobs. The Army continues to move in a positive direction; separate but equal in actions and deeds demonstrates an antiquated mindset, promotes gender bias, and does not promote inclusion and togetherness, which ultimately undermines trust.

2015 年，美國陸軍訓練與準則指揮部，針對性別融合的研究案例，其結論：戰鬥兵科相關單位與任務，不應將女性官兵排除在外；到了 2016 年，女性官兵已被允許派任戰

鬥官科及任務。雖然陸軍繼續積極朝上述改革方向前進，但男女官兵之間仍同工不同酬，軍方表現出的過時心態，加劇了性別偏見，無助於促進包容與團結，最終造成損害的是官兵之間的相互信任。

Trust(相信)

建立值得信賴的特定性別師友輔導機制

At times, men and women have different problems best addressed by someone who understands from their point of view. Gender-focused groups enable discussions to focus on the finer details of what it means to be a man or woman in the Army. For many women, it is much easier to discuss professional and personal issues with other women. No woman wants to portray weakness to the team, which makes female to female mentorship an absolute must for those who are looking for help. While men and women fill the same positions in the Army, women make up just 15% of the service. Women in gender-specific mentorship groups can relate to each other' s professional and personal hardships and address gender-specific issues and perceptions that arise in the Army. In 2013, a brigade commander at Fort Bragg, North Carolina, started a gender-specific mentorship program because he felt more comfortable with women addressing women' s issues. This is a pragmatic way of mentorship. The brigade commander knew he wasn' t able to provide mentorship at the level the female soldiers needed, so he enlisted the assistance of female senior leaders. On the other hand, Army Regulation 600-100: Army Profession and Leadership Policy states, "Trust is the bedrock of our profession." There are plenty of ways to develop leaders through mentorship, but an all-female or all-male group mentorship program might reinforce negative perceptions and biases of gender, hinder professional development and diminish trust. The exception to gender-focused group mentorship is for initial entry trainees. It is probable that their values and norms may not initially align to Army organizational culture. Gender-based

mentorship helps inculcate and transition young soldiers into the Army. Without trust, there is no profession.

有時，藉由瞭解男女性官兵對於看問題視角不同的人，去解決男性與女性間不同的問題，是最佳處理的方式。特定性別的輔導機制，可讓討論聚焦在陸軍男女性官兵，所在意的性別定位等敏感細節上。沒有任何女性願意向所屬團隊，訴說自己的弱點，因此對於許多女性官兵而言，與其他女性討論職業與個人問題要容易許多，此時對尋求幫助的人來說，女性對女性進行輔導，實屬必要。雖然男女官兵在陸軍皆可擔任相同職務，但女性只占陸軍成員的 15%。婦女在特定性別師友關係式輔導組中，可觸及彼此在專業與私領域上的艱辛之處，並處理特定性別在軍中引發的身份與定位問題。2013 年，位於北卡羅萊納州布拉格堡的一位旅長，認為由女性處理女性官兵的問題較為妥適，因此，啟動特定性別師友關係式輔導計畫，在當時是相當務實的作法。這位旅長知道以他的位階與專業，無法提供女性官兵所需師友關係式的輔導，因此他向高階女性指揮官尋求協助。另一方面，「陸軍條例 600-100:陸軍專業與領導統御政策」指出：「信任乃是軍事專業的根基」。可透過師友關係式輔導機制的許多作法，來增進官兵的領導能力，但相對的完全由女性或男性組成的師友關係式輔導計畫，可能會加劇官兵對性別偏見的負面看法、阻礙專業發展並降底信任度。由於新入伍士兵的價值觀與行為舉止，一開始並不符合陸軍的組織文化，因此，上述人員並不在陸軍特定性別師友關係式輔導關注目標之中。基於性別的師友關係式輔導機制有助於年輕官兵的培育，並將其轉變為軍隊所需之人才。所以沒有信任，就無法培養出專業戰士。

The Army must have a progressive mindset and a culture of trust to win our nation' s wars. In 1948, President Harry Truman' s Executive Order 9981 integrated military services based on race. That same year, Congress passed the Women' s Armed Services Integration Act granting women permanent status in military service. These presidential and congressional initiatives required racial and gender barriers be removed within the American military. To promote gender-based mentorship groups implies we are no better than we were before 1948. It is important to continue to push the limits of integration so the Army

does not retreat into separation. The Army must see women as equals and allow people to choose how they want to be mentored.

軍隊必須擁有進取的心態與值得信任的文化，才能贏得戰爭，保家衛國。1948 年，杜魯門(Harry Truman)總統的 9981 號行政命令通過，取消兵役制度中的種族隔離。同年，國會通過了《武裝部隊婦女服役法案》，賦予婦女從軍的永久地位；這些總統與國會簽署通過的法案，要求消除美軍內部的種族與性別隔離。現在倡導成立以性別為導向的師友關係式輔導機制，代表我們並未比 1948 年以前的作法，更為細膩。而為了讓陸軍不要退回到種族隔離的作法，持續突破性別融合的極限，事關重大，因此軍隊必須平等對待婦女，並允許官兵選擇所要的輔導措施。

All soldiers and leaders need access to professional and personal support in order to advance their professional and personal goals. This support may be tailored as a group for a gender or other specification such as race or national origin. Mentorship is a personal topic, and it' s not “one size fits all.” As your career progresses, you will have different needs, and the way you receive and give mentorship will change. The time and resources you commit to gender-specific groups, or not, is up to you.

所有的官兵都應得到專業與個人的支援，讓他們的事業與個人的目標，得以實現。這種支援可以取決於性別或其他標準，例如:以種族或國籍的方式，量身訂製。師友關係式輔導機制事關個人私密議題，不會是一體適用。隨著階級及職務升遷的同時，你將面臨不同的需求，在師友關係式輔導機制中接受或給予諮商指導，是會隨時空因素改變。因此，是否要將時間與心血投入特定性別輔導組，取決於你自己。

Being part of a mentorship group is an individual choice and must be treated as such. Friends and colleagues will most likely have a different perspective on mentorship, and that is OK. Mentorship is about developing yourself and those

around you. The goal is to ensure both men and women have a safe space to discuss issues, challenge critical thinking skills and progress as leaders.

加入師友關係式輔導小組，係個人的選擇且須一本初衷。朋友與同事，對師友關係式輔導機制的看法，或許與你不同，但無傷大雅。師友關係式輔導機制係用來啟發自己與周遭人士，其目標是確保男女官兵有安全空間，用以討論公私議題，挑戰批判式思維的辯論技巧並獲得前瞻性進步。

Regardless of your choice to join or not join a gender-specific mentorship group, it is your choice.

因此，不管你是否參與特定性別師友關係式輔導機制小組，這都是您的選擇。