# 產前檢查診斷失誤致誕生身障兒 之民事責任(上)

王 富 仙\*

# 目 次

摘要

壹、前言

貳、簡介各國實務與立法例

- 一、美國實務見解
- 二、法國
- 三、奧地利
- 四、日本實務見解
- 五、德國實務見解
- 六、西班牙實務見解
- 七、大陸實務見解
- 八、我國實務見解
- 參、父母、身障子女請求權基礎
  - 一、契約責任:醫療契約上的不完全給付
  - 二、侵權行為

**關鍵詞:**計畫外生育、人工流產、請求權基礎、自主決定權、人格權、人性尊嚴、 扶養費、非財產上損害。

**Keywords:** Wrongful Birth, Abortion, Rights for Claims, Autonomy of Decision, The Right of Personality, Human Dignity, Alimony, Non-Property Damages.

責任編輯:張煥熙

<sup>\*</sup> 國防管理學院法律研究所,國防部高等軍事法院檢察署軍事檢察官,臺北榮民總醫院專員(退休)。

#### 摘 要

生殖醫學科技發展極為迅速,使人類得以控制其生育行為,加以社會倫 理、價值觀念變遷,墮胎並非隱諱的觀念,法律為尊重自主決定權,在一定要 件下允許施行人工流產,然醫療人員未盡善良管理人之注意義務致檢查診斷失 誤,因而提供錯誤資訊,致產下非所意欲之身障子女時,使父母必須承受極大 之財務及身心壓力,更讓家庭成員帶來絕望與痛苦,以致往往在醫病之間產生 極大爭議,尤其此類案件請求權人、請求權基礎、損害本質、損害賠償範圍等 等,即極具爭議。近年來更在世界各地發生損害賠償訴訟,不但為損害賠償法 帶來新的研究課題,更是目前國際上爭議性很大之法律問題。本文將以最高法 院92年度台上字第1057號判決「唐氏症兒案件」為基礎,首先,介紹各國立 法例與實務見解,之後,探討父母、身障子女請求權基礎及損害賠償範圍,期 望能有新的認識,突破亟待改變的混亂現狀。

# The Civil Liability of the Disabled Children's Birth **Caused by Mistakenly Prenatal Diagnosis**

# Fu Hsien Wang

### **Abstract**

Reproductive Medicine is an extremely rapid developing technology, so that the behavior of human beings can control their fertility, with social ethics, values change, and abortion no longer a taboo concept. In order to respect the autonomy of legal decisions, under certain requirements to allow an abortion, medical personnel deficiencies notice that a good administrator obligation cause diagnosis errors, thus providing erroneous information when induced birth of disabled children of non-wills, so parents must bear the financial and great physical and mental pressure, leaving family members to suffer from despair and pain. There is often seen between doctors and patients a great controversy, especially in such cases the claimant's claims based on the nature of the damage, compensation for damages, etc., that is highly controversial. In recent years, there have been all over the world more cause of actions for damages, which not only brings up new research topics for the Damage Compensation Act, but also a lot of controversial legal issues internationally. According to the Supreme Court bench ruling No. 92 Year 1057 judgment "of cases of Down's syndrome children" as the basis, this paper will firstly introduce legislation of each country and practical ideas, then discuss parents of disabled children whose rights to request compensation for damages in the foundation and expectations to have a new understanding, through breaking the chaos of the status quo to be changed.